# "FILLING UP THE OTHER KETE": AMBIVALENCE, CRITICAL MEMORY, AND THE RESILIENCE OF OLDER MĀORI JEWISH WOMEN

# Hadas Ore University of Auckland

This article is part of the first study on the memories that Māori Jews share growing up and living in contemporary Aotearoa/New Zealand as well as the effect of their memories on their well-being and success in life. The study was conducted through open-ended in-depth interviews during 2016-2017. Examining more closely how six older women negotiate power and constitute indigenous agency, the analysis in this article looks into the particular way they employ their critical memory in order to overcome their ambivalence toward tertiary education. In my analysis, I apply the recent development in the theory of nostalgia with empirical studies on Māori women, Māori women in tertiary education, and Māori wellbeing. I demonstrate that these women negotiate kinship relations between up to four generations as they take on tertiary education, which is articulated by their metaphor of "filling up the other kete" (the basket of knowledge). I argue that this metaphor epitomizes how these women embed their memories in Māori practices, including learning Te Reo Māori (the language), to overcome their ambivalence toward tertiary education and ameliorate well-being. Their ambivalence contributes to their political awareness and to navigating between Māori, Pākehā, and Jewish knowledges as they become resilient role models for the next generation.

#### Introduction

This article stems from My Postdoctoral Research Project,<sup>1</sup> the first ethnography of contemporary Māori Jews in Aotearoa/New Zealand, which

examines how memories of home are employed to enhance well-being and success in life by indigenous people with mixed ethnicity. Here, I base my analysis specifically on the memories of six older Māori Jewish women who were over fifty years old at the time of the study, analyzing their emotions as expressed during the open-ended in-depth interviews I held in 2016–2017. In these interviews, the women typically conveyed a "no-fuss" attitude toward their mixed ethnic identity, which they related directly to their Māori Jewish *tupuna* (ancestors). I look closely at how these women regard, in hindsight, their own actions with relation to undertaking tertiary education and in some cases an academic career from their relatively advanced point in life thanks to their age and education. I then elaborate on their ambivalence toward their path in the "whitestream" of tertiary education (Bunda, Zipin, and Brennan 2012) as a way of demonstrating this ambivalence.

At the outset of this article, I wish to point out that, on the whole, these six women express ambivalence due to racism internal and external to their whānau (extended families) when remembering home, similarly to all the other participants in the study, as I argued in a previous article (Ore 2018). The twenty-one Māori Jewish participants in the overall study group employ defiant memory when remembering home to cope with and overcome racism as part and parcel of the infrastructure of their intimacy at home. While expressing nostalgic longing for their tupuna (ancestors), they employ their expressions of ambivalence toward home as a means to critique and overcome racism and other ethnic, religious, and gender-based tensions. In my previous article, I have shown that Māori Jews who live with memories of multiple homes that are grounded in different worldviews become highly skilled in negotiating the social boundaries and hierarchies in their whakapapa (genealogy, bloodlines).

However, in addition to that ambivalence in remembering their mixed tupuna, the six older Māori Jewish women in this study shared strong ambivalence toward their tertiary education, implied by the absence of their claim toward an academic career. Considering that three of the six women who hold a PhD were employed by universities in Aotearoa/New Zealand, I was struck by the fact that they shied away from articulating their paths as such and claimed this was not initially intentional. The other three women hold an MA degree, and all six women emphasized their choice of studying practical subjects that relate to health and education. Demonstrating how the women employ their ambivalence toward tertiary study in this article, I explain why their actions could be considered as conveying resilience. I define resilience as resistance that derives from flexibility and strength. In the context of these women's lives, resilience is conveyed by their explicit multiple associations with different worldviews and knowledges despite tensions on the basis of racial, ethnic, religious, and gender affiliations. Their resilience is also expressed by their ability to feel

comfortable in their own skin and their "no fuss" attitude toward their mixed identity.

The theory I employ is based on the new development in the anthropology of nostalgia, which articulates the contradictory way that people express longing for the home they have left behind to convey intimacy and affinity while simultaneously critiquing that home by expressing ambivalence. I expand on this theory and further the understanding of women's specific ambivalence by incorporating empirical studies on the intergenerational differences in the experience of Māori women (Houkamau 2011), Māori women in tertiary education (Fitzgerald and Smyth 2014), and Māori well-being (Houkamau and Sibley 2011; Muriwai, Houkamau, and Sibley 2015). I do so in order to bring to the fore important nuances in understanding the well-being of contemporary Māori, particularly the place of ambivalence in the life of indigenous women in light of their ethnic diversity in the context of tertiary education. This social positioning of indigenous women in tertiary education and in academia is historically recent in Aotearoa/New Zealand, and the experiences of these women have hardly been researched, similarly to indigenous women in Australian academia (Bunda, Zipin, and Brennan 2012). I relate to other studies on ambivalent groups in other settings and contexts to learn more about their ambivalence and actions. I draw on studies from Aotearoa/New Zealand on international migrants who are making their new homes (Nelson Agee and Culberton 2013; Ore 2015), indigenous women in Australian academia (Bunda, Zipin, and Brennan 2012), and Israeli residents of mixed Arab-Jewish neighborhood (Nathansohn 2017) to support the recognition in ambivalence as an important part of the restoration and maintenance of well-being.

The article first introduces important background for the turn in the theory of nostalgia with regard to understanding how women remember home. This section also integrates empirical data from social psychology on the typical intergenerational differences between younger and older Māori women that are blurred by the women in this study and their ambivalence toward tertiary education. The studies on Māori well-being emphasize that connections with Māori cultural practices safeguard their well-being. Next, I describe the methodology used in conducting my study. I then analyze the women's memories using extracts from the interviews and summaries of the interviews to illustrate how the women reworked their ambivalence by negotiating kinship relationship in their whakapapa. I show that during their tertiary studies, the women also politicize as Māori and become motivated to improve the well-being of Māori people, a motivation manifested through their subject choices. In the final remarks, I establish my claim that the women's choices, memories, and experiences constitute their feelings of being "at home" (i.e., comfortable) by overcoming their ambivalence toward tertiary education and academia. I argue

that their ambivalence contributes to and constitutes their political awareness and their navigation between Māori, Pākehā, and Jewish knowledges as they become resilient role models for the next generation. Their navigation is also expressed by negotiating kinship relationship and expressing resilience. The comparison to migrants in Aotearoa/New Zealand and indigenous women in Australian academia reinforces my claim that whether the social boundaries and hierarchies that create dialectic tensions are "within" people, that is, in their relationship with families and whakapapa, or "around" them, that is, in their residential neighborhoods, these boundaries generate ambivalence that people overcome in various ways that manifest resilience.

#### Theory: Women's Journeys Home Fraught with Ambivalence

Since the 1990s, drastic changes in the literature on nostalgia—the pain of longing to return home—corresponded to rising recognition for different types of localized feminisms that are grounded in specific cultures. Emphasizing how women express their resistance via nostalgic remembrance of their past homes, the developments around the issue of gendered power relations are recognized in the influential work of Leo Spitzer (1999). Spitzer established an element of defiant memory in nostalgia, pointing out that migrants may resist certain societal and cultural aspects of home by, for example, contesting racism (see also Berdahl 2009; McDermott 2002; Sugiman 2005). Thus, scholars whose work is situated in feminist literature on nostalgia from the 2000s on have depicted this emotive phenomenon as liberating women (Bardenstein 2002; Duruz 2001: 29-30; 2004; McDermott 2002; Parla 2009; Radstone 2010; Rubenstein 2001; Salih 2003; Sugiman 2005). In a case study examining the life stories of Japanese-Canadian migrant women in Canada, for example, Pamela Sugiman (2005) claims that these women reclaim their power, dignity, and positive identity through their expressions of nostalgia for their youthful pre-World War II lives in Japan (49, 65), which was deliberately destroyed via "cultural genocide" during the war (49).

Similarly, Māori women have been recovering and revitalizing their culture since the renaissance in the 1980s, and the number of Māori women who were previously absent from academia is slowly growing. Megan Fitzpatrick and Jeanette Berman's (2016) study highlights that mature Māori women are the largest-growing cohort of Māori engaging in tertiary education at degree level in Aotearoa/New Zealand. The process of these women's cultural recovery and revitalization was articulated by one of the six women in my study group through the metaphor of "filling up the other *kete*," especially associated with her decision to learn Te Reo Māori (the language). Her metaphor derives from the renowned Māori myth about the creation of the world, wherein three kete,

or baskets, are metaphoric vessels of knowledge that is vital for the well-being of humans and their relationships with the environment. Tāne, the forbearer of mankind, the forest, and all the creatures of the forest, ascends through the many realms to the uppermost realm of Io-Matua-Kore (God-the-Parentless) and obtains from Io these three baskets of knowledge. Tāne returns to Papatūānuku (Earth Mother) with these kete and there creates humankind. The three kete brought from the heavens by Tāne are *Te kete aronui*, religious, ceremonial, and other advanced knowledge relevant to the enlightenment of people and to the preservation of physical, spiritual, and mental well-being; *Te kete tuauri*, knowledge of rituals and the history and practices of human lineages; and *Te kete tuatea*, the repository of evil knowledge.<sup>2</sup> The influence and connection of these baskets of knowledge on the well-being of Māori are also illustrated in the two following *whākatoki* (proverbs): Whaowhia te kete mātauranga (Fill the basket of knowledge) and Ā tō rourou, nā taku rourou ka ora ai te iwi (With your food basket and my food basket the people will thrive).

Empirical research in social psychology on Māori shows that the well-being of individual Māori is understood as separate from national well-being and is influenced by the extent of their connections with their Māori identity and cultures, which protect them from stress (Muriwai, Houkamau, and Sibley 2015). Yet despite the cultural renaissance and ongoing decolonization of indigenous thinking in the past four decades, there is growing awareness among contemporary Māori that going back to one's cultural roots is only a partial solution to better their national well-being (Houkamau and Sibley 2011). Moreover, based on their study of five Māori women who are mature students (over twenty-five years old), Fitzpatrick and Berman (2016) show that the women share a dissonant experience: on the one hand, they regard undergoing tertiary education as conceding to demands to assimilate and take on "Pākehā ways" (the ways of white Europeans). As Bunda, Zipin, and Brennan (2012) claim with regard to the growing presence of indigenous people in Australian academia, universities have yet to transform and cease the colonization of indigenous people by including their knowledge and fully recognizing their labor and rights to lands in their pedagogy, structure, and systems. On the other hand, indigenous people are also aware of the empowerment and the abilities afforded to tertiary-educated indigenous women.

Looking further into issues of Māori well-being, Carla Houkamau (2011) raises the importance of understanding the impact of cultural diversity within Māori to explain the current complexity in paradigms of Māori identity. In her PhD on thirty-five Māori women, Houkamau (2011) points out intergenerational differences that illustrate the impact of colonization in Aotearoa/New Zealand from a sociohistoric context. Houkamau demonstrates that older Māori women who were raised in rural areas dedicate their time to whānau

commitments by participating in social and economic activities within their *iwi* (tribes), whereas younger Māori women who were raised in urban areas choose careers that express high politicization by prioritizing Māori interests and forming close relationships with other urban Māori. As shall be seen, the memories of the six older Māori Jewish women in my study blur the intergenerational differences found by Houkamau. This calls attention to the impact of their mixed ethnicity and raises the question of the place of their ambivalence toward academia as they negotiate connections with ancestors, highlighting the multifaceted nature of their memories.

In sum, nostalgic ambivalence in remembering the past is now recognized as a common emotive phenomenon among migrants and refugees that expresses their resistance and critique. In addition, ambivalence (or dissonance) is also recognized in the experience of indigenous women in academia. However, the place of ambivalence in contributing to well-being and resilience has yet to be explored, which is my main aim in this article.

# The Participants and the Methodology

The data showcased in this article are based on in-depth, open-ended interviews with six Māori Jewish women who are part of the twenty-one interviewees that participated in my postdoctoral research project. Māori Jews in this project are defined as those who recognize their own Māori and Jewish whakapapa (ancestry, genealogy, lineages or [bloodline]). The intermarriage between Māori and Jewish ancestry occurred as far back as eight to ten generations ago. This means that one woman had Māori and Jewish parents who intermarried in the 1950s, and another had fourth-great Jewish and Māori grandparents who intermarried in the 1830s. According to Jewish Halachic laws and the laws of the state of Israel, only the Jewish maternal bloodline and orthodox conversion are considered as valid for identification as Jewish. Moreover, according to matauranga Māori (lore, worldviews), mothers have the right and the obligation to raise their children according to their own religion and culture. The six women in this study are aware of this cultural similarity. Nevertheless, those who had Jewish ancestors and Māori ancestors through the paternal bloodline still regarded themselves as both Jewish and Māori, and I recognize and acknowledge their self-identification as such.

I chose participants who belong to different whānau,  $hap\bar{u}$ , and iwi to increase the range of their experiences, though, unbeknownst to them, several are remotely related. The participants reside mainly in Auckland and other cities in Aotearoa/New Zealand. The six women whom I base this article on share an interest Te Reo Māori (the Māori language) and to various degrees in Hebrew, with four of the women speaking Te Reo Māori fluently and two of the

women speaking some Hebrew. In accordance with their high level of tertiary education, the six women are mainly professionals in the arts, health, and education. The exception is a woman who worked in media and in real estate.

The interviews I conducted were between two and five hours, according to the participants' wishes, carried out at their homes, in cafés, and via electronic communication. The interviews were recorded and partly transcribed. I began every session by asking permission to record the interview and reminding participants that anything not said off the record could become so on their request. After a participant signed the ethics consent form, I would ask for personal details or a short demographic profile regarding their age, profession, education, familial status, and place of residence. I also asked about where they grew up and their memories about home and their childhoods. Usually, I would finish the conversation by asking the participant to define home and explain their concept of it to me, locate where they feel at home, and finally define how they see their well-being and grade their current state on a scale from one to ten.

After every interview, I would write up an overview of the meeting, which took the same length of time that I spent with the participant. In this detailed summary, I reflected on what had been said and included descriptions of the atmosphere, the rapport, any striking elements, moments of laughter and tears we shared, and a key sentence that distilled each woman's distinct character. I would do so to enhance the rest of my analysis, whereby I would identify key themes that were common across multiple interviews. I would often receive photos and clarifications regarding names, dates, and locations via e-mail as well as questions pertaining to such matters. I also offered the participants copies of transcriptions and analysis of my findings. In my ethnographic analysis, I use pseudonyms to protect the privacy of the six women, and I refrain from disclosing specific details about their iwi and *marae* for this reason.

#### On Mixed Ethnicity: Is Remembering Being Māori and Jewish an Issue?

The six women in my study grew up in both rural and urban communities and later either immigrated to a big city in order to gain tertiary education or simply stayed living in a big city. One of the six women returned to her rural community after she finished her education, whereas the other five women remained in a big city. The six women developed careers mainly in health and education in ways that contributed to the well-being of Māori. Two of the women are involved in Te Tiriti o Waitangi claims of their iwi, and all of them maintain strong connections with their whānau and the marae in their *papakāinga* (village, as home ground) to nourish both their rural communities and their urban networks, corresponding to the findings of Natasha Gagné (2013) in her ethnography on urban Māori in Auckland.

The six women are divided into two groups of three based on their different attitudes to being Jewish: the first group of three women regarded being Jewish as a minor issue in terms of their upbringing at home, whereas the second group regarded being Jewish as a major subject generating reflexivity. Since the memories and experiences of the latter group demonstrate more clearly how tertiary education contributed to their negotiation of relationship with whakapapa, this group will be discussed in a separate section. Nevertheless, all six women expressed great ambivalence toward their tertiary education and academic career if they had one. Below is a short presentation and analysis of the former group of three women for whom being Jewish played a minor part in their life.

Miriam is the eldest of two children. She had just retired from academia at the time of the interview and moved back to live in her parents' home with her sister. She never married or had any children. Her parents, however, came from large families of eleven children each. Miriam said about her mother.

We had a very progressive mother who did not want many children, and believed in education and travel. . . . So I was born in Whangarei. I went to high school here. And then, because our town did not have a teachers' college or university we had to go to Auckland. And so, I went to Auckland as a 16 year old and I spent most of my life in there, except for a year in Rotorua of teaching down there as part of the qualification. And then back to Auckland, picked up jobs here and there. It was never a career path; teaching was a love not a career path. And I stayed in Auckland because one thing led to another. I ended up teaching English to migrants particularly war migrants from Vietnam and from most of the wars across the world. . . . My working life certainly has been in Auckland. But I always came in and out from where we live now. I was ten years the secretary chair of the businesses of our hapu. I have always played a part, but now that I am back here, there are other things that I can do as well. And one of them is restoring those inscriptions on these hundred plus year old headstones [in my local cemetery], which is fascinating.

Miriam said that the limited knowledge about being Jewish that her father passed to her was "shallow." When I asked for an example, she expressed her ambivalence by recounting reluctantly that her father would say, "We are good with keeping money because we have Jewish blood in us." Miriam claimed that following Māori tradition, she took on her mother's religious affiliations. Being Presbyterian like her mother, she went to Sunday school and learned the Bible stories. Her mother was Presbyterian, and her father was a nonpracticing Mormon.

Her family lived an austere and frugal life, following the motto "Godliness is next to cleanliness." Order and cleaning were very important to her family and still are, and there were no feasts or traditions that involved excessive gifting. We laughed that it was no wonder that her "Jewish moment" (as she termed it) had to do with cleaning the gravestone of her great-great-grandfather. In this regard, Miriam said,

Ah, well politically it is, it means that I would have to, for this particular family of ..., because he is not Māori, it was easier for me just to go with my cousin and we just start the work. If we had gone for some other member of the family, the extended family, we would have had to go through all the permission stuff, and the explanation, and sexism and all that rubbish, and I cannot be bothered with all that. So it was politically experienced to begin with.... He is the start.

After cleaning this gravestone Miriam was intrigued and amazed to find out that although her great-grandfather was Jewish, all the details, including his name, were engraved in Te Reo Māori. As she remarked, "I find that interesting, he completely, he totally assimilated with Māori, I would say."

Moreover, though Miriam experienced most of her life as a Māori woman, during her PhD she had time to reflect more about being Māori and experienced "an intensified Māori phase" in her life, as she put it. Miriam said she had realized that her role as a Māori woman with the title of a doctorate was to write letters to the council that would ensure better air quality because there is an ore plant that has been releasing blue smoke since the 1960s and no one seems to care. The councilors are all white men, and the only Māori councilor since the 1970s was her uncle, according to Miriam. Hence, through her actions, it is evident that Miriam is able to employ her power seamlessly as a Māori woman with a doctorate in the Pākehā world of her city's council.

Rachel is the third youngest of eight children. Both her mother and her father were born to big families of thirteen children each. Rachel was born and brought up in Auckland and Tonga. Her parents decided to move to Tonga when she was about eight years old to set up the Jehovah's Witnesses church on the island. For this reason, Rachel regards herself as "indigenous Māori-Tongan." Though she remembered all along that she has Jewish-Syrian and German ancestors, these did not have much impact when she carved out her identity through the course of her life. The lack of importance she attributed to being Jewish was equal to the lack of importance she attributed to being German, both threads remaining "relatively unexplored and undeveloped culturally," as she put it. The choice to define herself as Māori-Tongan is a result of a long process of exploration with certain defining points: becoming a mature student at the age of twenty-six

at the university despite her parents' discouragement as part of their censure toward tertiary education for women as Jehovah's Witnesses. She was studying in the 1980s, aware of the political movement of the Māori revival with Tama Iti and others, which influenced her own path when she took on psychology and sociology. Later, she designed the first Māori keyboard, possibly twelve years ahead of its time, investing personal money into it to ensure that "we [Māori] will have our language at the tip of our fingers, and will gain from this fast developing technology."

Being Jewish is something "completely normal and ordinary" for Sarah. "It is a simple fact that is just known and does not require any further worries, acts or anything," as Sarah put it. When I asked Sarah whether she had experienced a moment that was constructive to her being Jewish and Māori, at first she could not remember anything, but later she remembered that as an older Māori student in medical school, she was asked to do the karanga (as the woman-caller at the marae) and that there was one event for which she was doing the karanga where she felt that her mother and grandmother were with her as well as other whakapapa (ancestors). It was a powerful moment in which she felt her ancestors' spirits—not an easy moment to get through, even scary initially, but altogether positive. The other moment was a more negative one: in later years, it dawned on Sarah that her mother could not actually believe what she had said on her deathbed: "Do not to follow the Māori ways, because these would do you no good." Sarah remembered that even when they lived in England, her mother always had Māori artifacts in the house, and they would carry and cherish them everywhere they lived, so the advice did not make sense to Sarah, and for years she grappled with this memory. The way Sarah resolved it was to believe that her mother's advice was racist and untrue since her mother felt she had to "impart some generational 'wisdom' on her deathbed," most likely what people used to think and say at her time, but that her mother never actually believed that what she said was true, though it could not have been "unsaid" since she died.

In sum, once the six women in this study entered tertiary education, they became what I would term "reluctant academics" since they had not initially envisioned themselves as academics or aimed to become so. Their reluctance came across through their emphasis of serendipity rather than planning to enter tertiary education. The memories of Miriam, Sarah, and Rachel show clearly not only how they feel comfortable in their own skin but also how they overcame tension related to a gender bias toward women taking on tertiary education in the case of Rachel and racism toward Jews and Māori in the case of Miriam and Sarah, respectively. Miriam and Sarah share strong memories of ambivalent feelings and internalized racism in their relationship with their tupuna, which represents their critique toward the homes they grew up in. This critique is expressed by the memory of Miriam's father for being "shallow" and

racist toward Jews and the memory of refusing to condemn all Māori ways against her mother's deathbed advice for Sarah. For Rachel, the memory of taking on university studies against her parents' wish enhanced her ambivalence toward the academic institution, which is manifested by her articulate reference to colonization in carving out her political awareness during her studies.

As seen, their ambivalence is reworked by their respective choices: Rachel taking on tertiary study and contributing to Māori well-being and identity expression (developing the Māori keyboard), Sarah's regard for Māori ways as healthy and helpful, and Miriam recognizing and cleaning the gravestone of her Jewish ancestor as well as using her power and influence as a retired academic for the benefit of others. Aiming to use their power and influence for the benefit of others was the case for all six women who felt comfortable in the Pākehā world but not without criticism, as Miriam's memories show. Often, the Pākehā world of academia was criticized over antifeminist trends and for indigenous women's poor representation and lack of voice on matters that are communal and collective. The Māori world was often criticized for internal politics, as Miriam implies when she is referring to the order in which she decided to clean the gravestones of her ancestors and for placing the heavy weight of ancestral obligations on women's shoulders, as the memories of Lea show in the section below. The women manifested resilience since they stood their ground as Māori in tertiary education and academia, while they negotiated their ambivalences via their kinship relationships with their female kin, as shall be developed in the next section.

# Indigenous Women in Tertiary Education: Negotiating Kinship Relationships

The second group of three women in this study not only recognized their Jewish ancestry in practical, ritualized ways but also exemplified how taking on tertiary education was the result of the relationships they negotiated with their mothers, grandmothers, and daughters (if they had any). These three women regarded their memories of affiliating with Māori and Jewish ancestry and respective cultural practices as equally important. Their experiences and memories are exemplified in my conversation with Lea, Jade, and Rebecca.

Lea is the oldest of six children. Lea has a partner but never married or had children. When she was growing up in her mother's home, Lea was sent to Sunday school to learn Hebrew and Jewish studies, and the family used to celebrate the main Jewish festivals at home with another neighboring family. Lea's mother was a Jewish Māori cultural revivalist, resulting in Lea attending the Jewish youth movement Habonim in Aotearoa/New Zealand for several years. This attendance culminated at the age of eighteen when Lea spent time in a

kibbutz in Israel. In the kibbutz, she learned Hebrew by doing Ulpan (intensive Hebrew course). Then she traveled in Europe, and once she returned home, she studied German as part of her MA. Courses in Te Reo Māori were not available at that time. Her mother's second husband, who was Pākehā, adopted her officially and helped raise her, but all major educational decisions were in her mother's hands. As Lea remembered,

I think part of the tension was when my mother was alive she would always place things on me and I'd think: "my god, I really don't want to do that," you know, laying it all on me the expectation that I would carry on a lot of these things, when it was not necessarily the priority I had to myself. Um. And yet I have maintained an interest and I'm always the first to defend Māori rights if any bigoted person starts going on about it, and it's part of my job too, so, you know.

Hadas: So could you say that you lived up to her expectation?

Lea: To a certain extent, but you know, I'm not putting myself forward to be on the iwi Rūnanga [the governing council or administrative group of a Māori hapū or iwi] and I'm not putting myself forward to be on everything, cause there's only so much, and some of my relatives their whole lives, I mean I don't know how they commit to so much, I mean, I don't think I could. I mean I, I, I have committed to being a trustee on a land trust, and I'll get involved in projects when I can, and I'll go and support various *hui* when I can, but I don't want to be an official trustee in too many, because I think particularly working full time it becomes too much, and I've got a partner and friends and so on, who are not involved in that world, really, ya, just trying to marry up all these different things is not a simple thing. Ah, ya, but context is absolutely everything. I mean. It's funny I mean being in a totally Jewish group sometimes I feel, I mean I know I'm Jewish. Maybe I am not Jewish as they are? Or amongst Māori—I am not as Māori as they are?

Lea's memories convey ambivalence that drives from two focal points: negotiating her relationship with her mother and her commitment to both the Māori and Jewish ways that her mother represented. Despite her resentment toward the obligation she feels for the legacy of her mother and for both cultural ways, Lea clearly remains obligated to her mother's double cultural commitments and thus manifests resilience. She is able to overcome some of the tensions that arise from her double commitment by setting clear boundaries and navigating her way between the worlds.

Jade is the youngest child of four. Jade is not married and has no children. She described herself as "the most Jewish and Māori" out of the siblings. She said that she can see her Jewish self when looking in the mirror. Many people think she is Indian and do not recognize her facial features as Māori, but she does. Her mother's parents (Jade's Jewish grandparents) were forcibly separated from their eight children and died in Theresinestadt. The children were sent to England and survived World War II. Her mother was eight years old at the time. She never spoke Polish or about Poland. Her mother lied about her age in England, claiming she was eighteen years old so she could study nursing (she was fifteen). When she met her husband-to-be, they fell in love and got married in England. Arriving in Aotearoa/New Zealand to meet his Māori family, as they got off the boat, they were welcomed with a *hongi*. The family story is that Jade's father was the youngest of nine and much loved, so his family made Jade's mother pass tests before they deemed her deserving and accepted her to the family. The first test was to get stung by a wasp that they put in the corn she ate. While eating the corn, she did get stung, and her father's Māori family loved her Jewish mother for being stung despite her red lipstick and unacceptably non-working-class features. Jade's Jewish mother took on her Māori father's culture during their life; she believed in *tapu* and followed other cultural beliefs. For example, as a nurse, she disliked keeping blood in the hospital refrigerator, which was meant for keeping food. As Jade put it, her parents' "master plan was to push all four children to study at university or teachers' college." Her parents moved to Auckland from Rotorua for this purpose, and indeed their plan was realized. The girls also did ballet in the afternoons, and generally they were pushed to do well in the Pākehā world. Jade described a happy childhood at the marae and later on in Auckland on a big family section with many fruit trees. Jade's eldest sister died of cancer around the same time that her mother was dying of cancer. Her eldest sister was a schoolteacher and a principal who took on the Māori ways, learning to speak Te Reo Māori fluently. After she died, the rest of the family lost touch with her children, possibly because of the pain and hurt induced by losing her. After the death of her father, Jade's mother tried to get "back" into Judaism by joining the congregation of Beit-Shalom, the Jewish progressive community in Auckland. But she only had four months of this "return home" before she got sick and died herself. This reestablished Jade's connection with her eldest sister's children.

Jade's memories are steeped with the loss of her kin: her mother's kin in the Holocaust and then her sister, mother, and father. Her ambivalence was conveyed through the racial issue of her looks in comparison to others and her siblings and the family story of her parents' arrival to Aotearoa/New Zealand. Due to the strong sense of loss, her ambivalence toward tertiary education is only hinted at by her saying that she fulfilled her parents' expectation and realized

that their "master plan [was] to push all four children to study at university or teachers' college." Jade also conveyed some critique toward her parents when she described her family life and upbringing as the epitome of a middle-class family, "being pushed to do well in the Pākehā world" and "doing ballet." In contrast to this critique, she felt compelled to clarify that she had a happy childhood and emphasized her parents' sacrifice to move to the city from Rotorua. Jade's resilience was manifested as she was explicitly proud of being Māori and Jewish and claimed that all her losses reminded her how to "live better with memories."

Rebecca is the eldest of six children. Remembering growing up at home she said.

Well my upbringing, I think a lot of my education was to do with past policies and the assimilation, where similar practices that impacted on the way my parents and other parents have viewed the world. My gran, my Kuia [Māori grandmother], my mum's mother, she went to school, she grew up in a Māori community speaking the language. And when she went to school English was the language, and she was smacked for speaking her language, so she didn't stay at school very long. And her English was a bit broken. But you know, brilliant in Māori things, of course, cause that's her world. So when mum was born, my grandmother, her mother, didn't want her to suffer the same negative school experience. So she sent my mum off to a boarding school at nine. Catholic! Māori girls' boarding school, where my mum eventually settled down and enjoyed herself, made a lot of friends. The nuns were great to her. Ahm . . . and she could, she is a native speaker in all the Māori practices and knowledge and so on.

Hadas: Did they practice any of this at school?

Rebecca: Well interestingly, the girls at school, although they were native speakers, chose to speak English. Because they wanted to be good at English, really fluent and knowledgeable about the English world and Western ways. And they were taught, the nuns taught mum, she told me, they taught her how to eat properly, how to use a knife and fork, you know, a butter knife for butter, you know, have a spoon for the jam, little special things, and how to dress properly, how to talk properly. A lot of those women from the boarding school were very proper, when they left school. They knew all the ways, western ways of behaving and they, it was kind of like another class way, you see some of those women and they have got all those cups and saucers, very dainty stuff, but so she had her English language knowledge and Māori. She

had her two kete full! So she was quite confident and strode out evenly balanced into the world. And when I was born in 1951, which makes me 84 [laughing at her purposeful inaccuracy] mum and dad thought that English is the best way forward. They actually spoke Māori to each other in the house, if they didn't want us to know what they were talking about. So we didn't grow up speaking the language, and I went to Catholic school. And then high school is where I learned Latin and French, but no, in my schooling there was no Māori at all, no cultural practices. And ah, so when I left I had my western knowledge, my kete of western knowledge was full, but my Māori one was pretty empty so I kind of stumbled into the world. Not well balanced at all. My identity was not strong. I don't think. I stumbled through highways and byways of life, taking the wrong turns for quite a long time, and then I lived in Aussie for a while, and then decided to come back. I had a bit of an identity crisis, cause people would say, I was working on the buses in Melbourne and I had Egyptians and Lebanese people thinking I was [like them], cause I think when I was younger I looked perhaps more Semitic, I had a different look about me when I was younger. And I'd have to explain myself: "No I'm Māori from New Zealand." Sometimes people would think I was Italian or, never who I really am or was. And then there came this urge in me to learn the language, and learn about my culture and be with the family. So I came home, and then met my daughter's dad, and had her, became pregnant with my daughter. And I had started out the journey of learning the language then. And got more and more, in those days you could go for a week long immersion, wananga, three times a year on school holidays. So I used to do that, go out to Ngati. . . . And then when she was ready to kohanga reo, then I was increasing my knowledge again to be in line with her.

Rebecca's memories show clearly how she had carved her political awareness while negotiating her experience in tertiary education alongside forming increasingly closer connections with herself through the Māori world and learning Te Reo Māori. Rebecca lays out the development of her academic studies and Te Reo study as the result of her relationship with her female tupuna: grandmother, mother, and daughter.

The key metaphor in the title of this article, "filling up the other kete," is derived from this interview. This metaphor encompasses and represents the experience of all six women and is by no means coincidental, relating to their political awareness and the long-term labor they invested in attaining cultural knowledge to alleviate their discomfort and create more balanced and healthier ways of living. The metaphor invokes fostering safety and comfort, as Rebecca

explained, since the balance enables one to walk proud, confident, straight, and tall, when stepping into the world rather than limping as one does when one hand is holding a full kete and the other has an empty kete.

The emphasis on the centrality of Te Reo Māori language when carving out their sense of place as home in Aotearoa/New Zealand and negotiating their ambivalence toward tertiary education as Māori while manifesting resilience was common to all six women. In later years, as older students in tertiary education, they were supported to study Te Reo Māori. If their study coincided with getting their children through the education system, this strong connection reinforced their desire to learn Te Reo Māori, as Rebecca's case demonstrates. In the other cases, once they got into tertiary education, their mental growth during that time also instigated their journey of learning Te Reo Māori and their political awareness.

The two women who were not fluent in Te Reo Māori remembered that their fathers recounted being beaten by the teachers at school for speaking Te Reo, so, despite the fact that both parents knew and spoke Te Reo Māori between themselves, their daughters were never fluent. They regard themselves as "passive bilinguals" since, though they heard and understood Māori while growing up in the village, they could never speak it fluently. Instead of learning to speak Te Reo Māori, they chose to promote Māori protocols, phrases, and proverbs, as well as place-names, stories, and myths, and emphasized their Māori looks.

## **Concluding Remarks**

The six older Māori Jewish women in my study express ambivalence toward tertiary education while remembering their past, which stems from racial, ethnic, religious, and gender-based tensions. The racial, religious, and gendered tensions within their whānau and beyond constitute dialectic tensions that generate ambivalence and reflexivity. This ambivalence is expressed in their reflexive claim of "filling up the other kete" through their study of Te Reo Māori, for example. This feminine metaphor stems from the Māori worldview and epitomizes their role in creating a safe and comfortable space for consolidating knowledge and improving well-being. Interestingly, the only study from indigenous women's perspectives in Australian academia begins with a quote that similarly uses the metaphor of the basket as a positive and hopeful prospect (Bunda, Zipin, and Brennan 2012, 1): "Why not learn to bear baskets of hope, love, self-nourishment and to step lightly? . . . Voyager, there are no bridges, one builds them as one walks" (Anzaldúa 1983: iv–v).

By applying the recent development in the theory of nostalgia, however, I argue that they employ their ambivalence toward tertiary education to make

themselves comfortable in their own skin as they embed their experiences, knowledge, and memories mainly in the Māori culture and the study of Te Reo Māori. Their actions express their resilience, as these enable them to negotiate kinship relationship with whakapapa and rework social boundaries and hierarchies. This course of action is commonly the case for international migrants who make their new home in Aotearoa/New Zealand (Nelson Agee and Culberton 2013; Ore 2015). Nathansohn (2017) shows that this is also true in the case of the residents of the mixed Arab-Jewish neighborhood Hadar in the city of Haifa who develop "reflexive coexistence," which may generate actions that eliminate the gap between Jews and Arabs or support it.

The six women in this study are situated in social positionings that generate ambivalence, which not only contributes to carving out their political awareness but also navigates their way between Māori, Pākehā, and Jewish worlds and knowledges as they become resilient role models for the next generation. Thus, the importance of older Māori Jewish women's memories is brought to the fore, demonstrating how their ambivalence toward tertiary education becomes a means for manifesting resilience. They resist and overcome the tension that derives from pressures to assimilate into the "whitestream" academia, not only by choosing subjects that will benefit the well-being of Māori but also by refraining from defining an academic career as their goal.

In particular, when remembering their tertiary education, these women are ambivalent and employ their ambivalent memories as a means to negotiate their power and kinship connections, in some certain cases between up to four generations of females: their grandmothers, mothers, themselves, and their daughters. As they are able to harness their ambivalence for constituting a safe harbor in flows of unhomely moments, they express much love and intimacy when negotiating their kinship relationships.

The older Māori Jewish women in my study who were raised in rural areas dedicated their time to whānau commitments by participating in social and economic activities within their iwi and chose careers that express high politicization, prioritizing Māori interests and forming close relationships with other urban Māori. Thus, the intergenerational differences that Houkamau found in her PhD study (2011) of Māori women do not apply to the women in my study. In fact, as they undergo tertiary education, the politicization of these indigenous women and their subject choices of health and education balance out their reluctance to become academics and participate in this part of the Pākehā world. Equipped with their titles of MA and PhD, these women feel able to better navigate between the Pākehā world and the Māori world and manifest resilience as they feel comfortable in their own skin.

In this article, I explicate the benefits of looking into the nostalgic ambivalence that indigenous women, namely, six older Māori Jewish women, express through their memories of home toward tertiary education. In doing so, I explore how, by negotiating their relationship with whakapapa, they also negotiate their ambivalence and express resilience. Notably, three of the six women chose not to marry and never had children, a point that may have contributed to their manifestation of resilience against pressures and one that is worth developing in another article. It is my hope that writing this article will invite more analysis that unpacks the ambivalences that indigenous people and indigenous women in particular share, pointing at their ways of expressing resilience and resistance in other contexts.

#### NOTES

- 1. I am grateful to the Dame Joan Metge postdoctoral award by the Kate Edgar Charitable Education Trust for funding the research project that this article is based on. I am also indebted to my wonderful supervisor Dr. Carla Houkamau, who guided me through, and the lovely people who participated in the study. My deepest thanks to my daughter Livne Ore for her indelible editing skills and attention to details.
- $2. \ https://teara.govt.nz/en/maori-education-matauranga/page-1 \ and \ http://maaori.com/whakapapa/ngakete3.htm.$

#### REFERENCES

#### Anzaldúa, Gloria

1983 Foreward to the second edition. In This bridge called my back: Writings by radical women of color, ed. C. Moraga and G. Anzaldúa, iv-v. New York: Kitchen Table/ Women of Color Press.

#### Bardenstein, Carol

2002 The gender of nostalgia, transmissions interrupted: Reconfiguring food, memory, and gender in the cookbook-memoirs of Middle-Eastern exiles. Signs 28 (1): 353–87.

#### Berdahl, Daphne

2009 On the social life of postsocialism: Memory, consumption, Germany. Edited by Matti Buntzl. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

#### Bunda, Tracey, Lew Zipin, and Marie Brennan

2012 Negotiating university "equity" from indigenous standpoints: A shaky bridge. *International Journal of Inclusive Education* 16 (9): 941–57.

#### Duruz, Jean

- 2001 Home cooking, nostalgia and the purchase of tradition. *Traditional Dwellings and Settlements Review* 12 (11): 21–31.
- 2004 Haunted kitchens: Cooking and remembering. *Gastronomica* 4 (1): 57–68.

#### Fitzgerald, Tanya, and Elizabeth M. Smyth

2014 Women educators, leaders and activists: Educational lives and networks 1900–1960. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

#### Fitzpatrick, Megan, and Jeanette Berman

2016 Cultural dissonance in tertiary education. MAI Journal 5 (2):137–49.

#### Gagné, Natacha

2013 Being Māori in the city: Indigenous everyday life in Auckland. Toronto: Univ. of Toronto Press.

#### Houkamau, C. A., and C. G. Sibley

2011 Māori cultural efficacy and subjective wellbeing: A psychological model and research agenda. *Social Indicators Research* 103 (3): 379–98.

#### Houkamau, Carla A.

2011 Transformations in Māori women's identity: Some things change, some stay the same. *Qualitative Research in Psychology* 8 (3): 292–313.

#### McDermott, Sinead

Memory, nostalgia, and gender in A Thousand Acres. Signs 28 (1): 389–407.

#### Muriwai, Emerald, Carla Houkamau, and Chris Sibley

2015 Culture as cure? The protective function of Māori cultural efficacy on psychological distress. New Zealand Journal of Psychology 44 (2): 14–24.

#### Nathansohn, Rage

2017 Living in a mixing neighborhood: Reflexive coexistence and the discourse of separation. PhD diss., Univ. of Michigan.

#### Nelson Agee, Margaret, and Philip Culberton

2013 Sowing the seeds: Parents' and grandparents' influences in the identity development of 'Afakasi young people. In *Pacific identities and well-being: Cross cultural perspectives*, ed. Margaret Nelson Agee, Tracey McIntosh, Philip Culberton, and Cabrini 'Ofa Makasiale, 50–65. Wellington: Otago Univ. Press.

#### Ore, Hadas

- 2015 "Can home come in a tin can?": How Jewish-Israeli migrant women savour home in New Zealand. PhD diss., Univ. of Auckland.
- 2018 Defiant memory and the infrastructure of intimacy: The thriving homes of Māori Jews in Aotearoa, New Zealand. In Sites 15 (2): 40–64.

### Parla, Ayşe

2009 Remembering across the border: Postsocialist nostalgia among Turkish immigrants from Bulgaria. *American Ethnologist* 36 (4): 750–67.

#### Radstone, Susannah

2010 Nostalgia: Home-comings and departures. *Memory Studies* 3 (3): 187–91.

#### Rubenstein, R.

2001 Home matters: Longing and belonging, nostalgia and mourning in women's fiction. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

#### Salih, R.

2003 Gender in transnationalism: Home, longing and belonging among Moroccan migrant women. London: Routledge.

#### Spitzer, Leo

1999 Back through the future: Nostalgic memory and critical memory in a refuge from Nazism. In *Acts of memory: Cultural recall in the present*, ed. Mieke Bal, Jonathan Crewe, and Leo Spitzer, 87–104. Hanover, NH: Univ. Press of New England.

#### Sugiman, Pamela

2005 Memories of internment: Narrating Japanese-Canadian women's life stories. In Diaspora, memory and identity: A search for home, ed. Vijay Agnew, 48–80. Toronto: Univ. of Toronto Press.